

Contempt of Court

Common Law Offence

Case (age if known)	Offence	Plea	Sentence	Appeal	Record	Facts
AG (NSW) v Whiley (23) (1993) 31 NSWLR 314	2 x Contempt of Court	PG	3y 6m NPP 18m		Long history of violence – breached parole and recognisance	Infant son taken into foster care – application by Department of Community Services to have child made permanent ward of state – during hearing before magistrate threatened to shoot foster parents and take child – intentional attempt to influence outcome of court proceedings by influencing Director General of department of Community Services - magistrate and – serious threat in view of long history of violence – threats repeated outside court
Registrar NSWSC v Glasby [1999] NSWSC 846 Adams J	Contempt	VG	MT 2y AT 4y (cumulative to existing murder sentence)			Female – refused to answer questions at murder trial for husband – deliberate attempt to frustrate course of justice – personally involved in murder herself – under domination of husband Some prospect of rehabilitation – sad background – mother to young child – suicide attempts
Prothonotary v Wilson (57) [1999] NSWSC 1114 Wood CJ at CL [2000] NSWCA 23	2 x Contempt	VG	FT 2y	AA FT 3m 20d	No priors	Threw two plastic bags full of paint at judge after delivering judgment against offender - premeditated offence No contrition or remorse - dentist – genuine belief in injustices of legal system – served time in Vietnam resulting in poor health – heart condition – devoted family man with dependent children – obsessive compulsive personality disorder – faces substantial financial hardship
R v Duncan (31) [2000] NSWSC 440 Dowd J	Contempt	VG	FT 2m		nil	Female - refused to give evidence in murder trial of de facto husband – no apology or adequate explanation – facing charges related to murder – importance of denunciation Good character – struggling with stress and depression – carer of daughter and twin sister

This table has been prepared by the Public Defenders as a guide. Individual cases should be read if they are to be relied upon.

Case (age if known)	Offence	Plea	Sentence	Appeal	Record	Facts
Justice Ireland v Russell (21) [2001] NSWSC 468 Ireland AJ	Contempt	PG	5y GBB		Breached bond	Female - car belonging to offender and partner used in murder – made statement to police identifying one of four occupants of car – initially refused to give evidence – agreed to give evidence via video link but no genuine attempt to be truthful – abusive and aggressive manner towards Crown 7m pregnant at time of trial – poor health – oldest of three children has cerebral palsy – father of children in gaol – contrition – fear for safety of children – 6 days custody
Principal Reg NSWSC v Jando (18) (2001) 125 A Crim R 473 NSWSC Studdert J Co-offender: DROLLET	6 x Contempt		12m PD		Record	Refused to answer Crown Prosecutor at robbery trial for co-offender – breach of undertaking to give evidence – feared co-offender and consequences in prison – received 6m discount from prison sentence for undertaking to give evidence Low intelligence – some evidence of rehabilitation
Re Ezold [2002] NSWSC 574 Barr J	Contempt		FT 6m (partially concurrent with existing sentence for murder)		Minor apart from related murder	Refusal to give evidence at murder trial of co-accused – convicted and sentenced for murder at separate trial – understood consequences of refusal – no serious consequences of refusal – refusal based on fear of retribution – never gave undertaking to give evidence
Principal Reg NSWSC v Drollet (20) [2002] NSWSC 490 Newman AJ Co-offender: JANDO	4 x Contempt	PG	FT 15m (cumulative to existing sentence for robbery offences)		Poor criminal record	Refused to answer questions at trial – threw container of water at judge –breached undertaking to give evidence in armed robbery trial – given credit for undertaking in sentence Serious drug problem

This table has been prepared by the Public Defenders as a guide. Individual cases should be read if they are to be relied upon.

Case (age if known)	Offence	Plea	Sentence	Appeal	Record	Facts
NSW Crime Commission v Field (61) [2003] NSWSC 5 Bell J [2008] NSWSC 103 Adams J [2009] NSWCA 144	Contempt	VG	FT 12m (partially concurrent to existing sentence for drug offences – effectively increased NPP by 6m) FT 4y 6m (partially concurrent with existing sentences – effectively increased NPP by 2y)	AD		Refused order to be examined by registrar under <i>Criminal Assets Recovery Act</i> – refused to answer questions in view of pending criminal trial – received legal advice Serious health problems After initial sentencing was ordered to appear for examination – continued to refuse to be examined and committed to imprisonment until further orders of court by Hulme J Subsequently appeared before Adams J for finalisation of sentence
Rustom (22) [2005] NSWSC 61 Dunford J	Contempt	PG	250h CSO		Bad record	Outburst against juror after announcement of murder conviction against brother – addressed female juror by name – intent to intimidate – significant effect on juror Evidence of recent rehabilitation
Principal Reg NSWSC v Assi [2005] NSWSC 183 Brownie AJ	8 x Contempt		12m NPP 3m (cumulative to existing sentenced for fraud offences)			Held himself out as a solicitor over two years knowing prohibited from doing so by Supreme Court – sentenced for related fraud offences – defrauded four people Gambling addiction Took into account sentence for related offences
Prothonotary NSWSC v McCaffrey [2005] NSWSC 1237 Latham J	29 x Contempt		12m NPP 6m Suspended			Appeared in court as barrister without current practicing certificate – combination of depression and financial difficulties – 14 months – deliberate conduct Contrition and remorse – good character
Styman (24) [2005] NSWSC 1329 Studdert J	Contempt	PG	FT 12m (cumulative to existing sentence for manslaughter)			Convicted of manslaughter at trial with co-offenders – co-offenders successfully appealed against murder conviction and sent for retrial – refused to give evidence and became verbally abusive – feared for safety in prison and safety of family Prospects of rehabilitation – difficult childhood

This table has been prepared by the Public Defenders as a guide. Individual cases should be read if they are to be relied upon.

Case (age if known)	Offence	Plea	Sentence	Appeal	Record	Facts
Comm Police Integrity Commission v Walker [2006] NSWSC 964 McDougall J	Contempt	VG	6m (referred for assessment for home detention)		No significant record	Refused to answer questions truthfully at Police Integrity Commission – subsequently answered questions Suffering depression – otherwise of good character – former police officer
Razzak (24) (2006) 166 A Crim R 132 NSWSC Johnson J	Contempt	PG	FT 15m		Larceny, GIC, traffic offences, mal wounding	Victim of shooting refused to take oath or affirmation when called by Crown at trial of shooter for attempted murder and murder – serious offence with substantial consequences – context of ongoing and violent feud between families – evidence suggests motivated by fear
Principal Registrar of Supreme Court of NSW v Thanh Vu Tran (2006) 166 A Crim R 393 NSWSC Buddin J	Contempt	PG	FT 4m			Refusal to answer questions at own trial - withdrew confession to murder and stood trial, claiming confession under duress – in giving evidence about duress, refused to answer questions in cross-examination - acquitted of principal charges but pleaded guilty to contempt – refusal based on fear of retribution. On remand for other offences.
Trad v Pickles Auction Ltd; in the Matter of Carl Trad [2006] NSWSC 1177 Hamilton J	Contempt	PG (25%)	21 days		Older offences	Refused to answer questions during civil proceedings in relation to ownership of a car – seriousness of offence applies equally to civil matters – feared for safety to himself and family
Prothonotary of Supreme Court of NSW v Katelaris [2008] NSWSC 389 Hoeben J [2008] NSWSC 702 Hoeben J	2 x Contempt	VG	12m suspended sentence		Contempt, drug cultivation	After conviction of drug cultivation offence, made insulting remarks in presence of jurors – further insulting remarks made to media outside court - not high level of seriousness - statement to TV journalists more serious matter – not planned or organised – absence of remorse. Medical practitioner until removed from Register in 2005 for prescribing and using drugs – stable family background.

This table has been prepared by the Public Defenders as a guide. Individual cases should be read if they are to be relied upon.

Case (age if known)	Offence	Plea	Sentence	Appeal	Record	Facts
Prothonotary of the Supreme Court of New South Wales v Hall [2008] NSWSC 994 Harrison J	Contempt	PG	Rising of the court		Record – outburst occurred while applying for bail for domestic violence offences	After being refused bail in Local Court made statements which had tendency to interfere with administration of justice – abusive towards magistrate – spontaneous outburst of anger Suffering drug withdrawal at time of offence – anti-social personality disorder – remorse – difficult personal circumstances Importance of reasonable and reasoned result
EI Jamal (23) [2009] NSWSC 686 Hulme J	Contempt	VG	9m – suspended		Assault and resist arrest	Brother on trial for murder – threatened witness during break in evidence in corridor outside courtroom – no significant premeditation – no threat to kill – no evidence threat influenced giving of evidence Fact that offender not following in footsteps of brothers as professional criminal a significant mitigating factor
Prothonotary of Supreme Court of NSW v Rakete (2010) 202 A Crim R 117 NSWSC Harrison J	Contempt	VG	GBB 9m		Nil	Filmed witness giving evidence with digital camera during high-profile court case - had no idea of consequences - just wanted to view some court cases. Custodial sentence not warranted. [Review of sentence principles].
R v Abdallah: In the matter of John Leger [2014] NSWSC 320 Campbell J	Contempt	PG (25%)	FT 6m		Appalling driving and traffic record	Refused to answer questions in murder trial of Abdallah - Abdallah shot associate of contemnor in street – shot at fleeing contemnor - acquitted of attempted murder of L contemnor – declined to give account to police or give evidence at committal or trial Suffering PTSD from shooting – protective custody
R v Abdallah: In the matter of Matthew Lewis (25) [2014] NSWSC 319 Campbell J	Contempt	PG (25%)	FT 3m			Refusal to answer questions in murder trial of Abdallah - Abdallah shot associate of contemnor in street – contemnor fled and did not witness second shooting at second person – declined to give account to police or give evidence at committal or trial Suffering anxiety after shooting

This table has been prepared by the Public Defenders as a guide. Individual cases should be read if they are to be relied upon.

Case (age if known)	Offence	Plea	Sentence	Appeal	Record	Facts
In the matter of Steven Smith (28) [2015] NSWSC 1141 Wilson J	2 x Contempt	PG (19%)	3y (Partially concurrent with existing sentence)		Lengthy	When called to give evidence against co-offender in murder sentence refused to take oath and became verbally and physically aggressive – threatened court officer – very serious examples – refused to purge contempt after legal advice Aboriginal with difficult background – given no warning he would be called to give evidence – related to co-offender – concerned would be labelled an informer in gaol – serving lengthy sentence for murder
DB Mahaffy & Assoc v Mahaffy [2015] NSWSC 1959	8 x Contempt	VG	<u>Aggregate:</u> 10 months			Failure to obey costs orders made by District Court, Supreme Court and Court of Appeal - deliberate failure to comply with subpoena - pursuit of sustained, baseless and deliberate attack on impartiality, honesty and integrity District Court judge - pursuit of baseless allegations of illegality and corruption against Supreme Court judge – contumacious contempt – calculated to undermine public confidence in courts and interfere with administration of justice No contrition – antecedents and character not favourable
In the Matter of Barnes (26) [2016] NSWSC 133 Hall J	Contempt	PG	1y 10m NPP 12m		Relatively minor	Refused to take oath or affirmation in preparation for giving evidence at murder trial – some evidence he was motivated by fear of reprisals
Prothonotary of the Supreme Court of NSW v Fajloun [2016] NSWSC 927 Rothman J	5 x contempt	PG (17%)	4y GBB		Significant record	During trial for serious assault charges offender became frustrated and angry – on several occasions over multiple days wilfully insulted judge by swearing – spat at judge – threw paper cup – spontaneous offences – serious contempt Apology given to court – already serving sentence for original trial offences
Prothonotary of the Supreme Court of New South Wales v Mallegowda [2016] NSWSC 1087 Adams J	Contempt	PG (19%)	9m NPP 6m Suspended		Nil	During defamation proceedings made threatening phone calls to two witnesses – impulsive acts Suffering mental illness which affected culpability and time in prison – good character

This table has been prepared by the Public Defenders as a guide. Individual cases should be read if they are to be relied upon.

Case (age if known)	Offence	Plea	Sentence	Appeal	Record	Facts
Prothonotary of the Supreme Court of New South Wales v Ceren [2016] NSWSC 1187 Harrison J	Contempt	PG	12m GBB		Related offences of conspiracy to cause GBH and procure commission of serious indict offence	Female – refused to give evidence against co-offender – loss of significant evidence to crown – became fearful of way persons assisting authorities treated in gaol – feared for safety of family Released to parole – 19y when involved in substantive offence – difficult background – remorse – did not originally gain from promise to give evidence
Prothonotary of the Supreme Court of NSW v A [2017] NSWSC 495 Bellew J	Contempt	PG (20%)	12m suspended sentence		Nil significant	Pleaded guilty to offence of recklessly firing at dwelling place and agreed to give evidence against co-offender – when called to trial of co-offender failed to appear then refused to give evidence – evidence vital to Crown case - original conviction quashed on appeal and pleaded guilty to being accessory after the fact – subsequently gave evidence against co-offender who pleaded guilty – significant objective gravity – feared for personal safety Remorse – good prospects of rehabilitation
Prothonotary of the Supreme Court of New South Wales v Jarvie (56) [2017] NSWSC 786 Fagan J	Contempt	PG (15%)	3m (immediate release)		Old criminal record – not fraud related	Altered signed and sealed orders of the Supreme Court – property dispute after separation - altered orders regarding sale of house to suggest money to be paid to offender not estranged de facto wife – involved \$231,000 – alteration easily uncovered and would never have succeeded Inordinate and unacceptable delay in pursuing charge Back injury making custodial conditions difficult – genuine remorse
Doe v Dowling [2017] NSWSC 1037 Harrison J	Contempt	VG	FT 4m		Contempt in similar circumstances	Published article online with names of plaintiffs – failed to comply with take down order and published further articles on Facebook, online and twitter account – intentional, wilful and deliberate action – views himself as journalist and proponent of free speech – seeks financial donations through website – need for deterrence and denunciation
The Prothonotary of the Supreme Court of NSW v AS [2018] NSWSC 664 Latham J	Contempt	PG (25%)	FT 9m		nil prior to drug offences	Sentenced for involvement in serious drug offences and given 5% discount for future assistance – refused to give evidence at trial of co-accused citing fear for family – sustained and emphatic refusal to answer questions Referred to principles set out in <i>Wood v Staunton</i> (1996) 86 A Crim R 183

This table has been prepared by the Public Defenders as a guide. Individual cases should be read if they are to be relied upon.

Case (age if known)	Offence	Plea	Sentence	Appeal	Record	Facts
Prothonotary of the Supreme Court of NSW v Dowling (50) [2018] NSWSC 1301 Wilson J [2018] NSWCA 340	3 x Contempt	VG	9m (each) Total: 18m NPP 13m	AA 4m	contempt offences	Disrupted proceedings before a registrar at call-over by loudly and aggressively making insulting and baseless paedophile allegations about registrar and another named judge – published allegations on internet in deliberate contravention of court orders prohibiting publication – serious and deliberate breaches On appeal – considered application of <i>Crimes (SP) Act</i> to contempt proceedings – sentence excessive – irrational abuse
Prothonotary of the Supreme Court of NSW v Lyel [2020] NSWSC 1760 Adamson J	Contempt	PG	4m		Subsequently dealt with for dishonesty offences	Female created false email address and emails to mislead court in eviction proceedings – falsely represented that owners of property agreed with application for continuation of stay – continued deception in court resulting in court orders – serious offence - interfered with Court's capacity to do justice – contumacious Mental health issues reduced moral culpability to limited extent
He v Sun [2020] NSWSC 1298 Ward CJ at Eq [2021] NSWCA 95	4 x Contempt	VG	6 weeks (concurrent)	AD	nil	In context of civil proceedings search warrant for home of offender executed – offender permitted access but deliberately deleted material on several electronic devices over several hours – most serious class of case – frustrated related proceedings Apology made – impact of imprisonment on wife and two young children – low risk of re-offending – good character
Seven Network (Operations) Ltd v Dowling (No 2) [2021] NSWSC 1106 Rees J	Contempt	VG	10m		Three previous contempt offences	Defied court orders and posted confidential material on twitter and website – made website anonymous causing cost to plaintiffs – ongoing course of conduct – serious contempt No contrition – entrenched views – importance of personal deterrence

Last updated: Sept 2021

This table has been prepared by the Public Defenders as a guide. Individual cases should be read if they are to be relied upon.