

Murder: 2021

Maximum Penalty: Life (s.19A (NSW) Crimes Act)

Standard non-parole period (offences committed on or after 1.2.2003)

20 years

25 years - Where the victim was a police officer, emergency services worker, correctional officer, judicial officer, health worker, teacher, community worker, or other public official, exercising public or community functions and the offence arose because of the victim's occupation or voluntary work

Standard non-parole period (where conviction entered or plea of guilty made on or after 1.1.2008)

25 years - Where the victim a child under 18 years of age

	NAME (age if known)	PLEA	SENTENCE	APPEAL	SUMMARY OF RECORD	HOW KILLED	INVOLVEMENT & SUMMARY
1.	WHITELEY (26) [2021] NSWSC 153 Rothman J	VG	35y NPP 24y		Extremely limited	Assault Intent GBH	SNPP 25 years Killed 20mth step daughter – 13 injuries to neck and head and 16 injuries to trunk – assault probably started while child in her bed and included being thrown against drawers – spontaneous assault over several minutes with no motive – assault reflected emotional dysfunction related to mental and personality disorder – breach of trust - above mid-range Sexually abused and mistreated as a child – mental health and personality disorder – some remorse – good prospects of rehabilitation – some reduction for conduct of trial
2.	BOTRUS (No.6) (18) [2021] NSWSC 199 Walton J	VG	20y NPP 14y		On bail in Children's court	Single stabbing Intent GBH	SNPP 20 years Stabbed male victim seated at barber's - victim known to offender – “targeted” - victim had no warning of attack – single blow – planning and premeditation. Substance abuse disorder – social disadvantage – tumultuous early childhood in Iraq – refugee background – remorse – rehabilitation

This table has been prepared by the Public Defenders as a guide. Individual cases should be read if they are to be relied upon.

	NAME (age if known)	PLEA	SENTENCE	APPEAL	SUMMARY OF RECORD	HOW KILLED	INVOLVEMENT & SUMMARY
3.	PHAM [2021] NSWSC 528 Wilson J	VG (assistance 10%)	30y 7m NPP 22y 11m		AOABH, affray, violence, BES, larceny, supply drugs, dishonesty - on conditional release order	Stabbed Intent to kill	SNPP 20 years Victim purchased drugs from offender – stabbed victim in back – victim ran and fell, stabbed further three times to heart, chest and back – knife lodged in victim’s spine and snapped – with co-offender dragged body back inside apartment - offender mutilated and partially dismembered body for disposal – stole victim’s car and wallet – not possible to state why killed victim - possible argument. Early drug use – adverse childhood – assistance.
4.	NEY (20) [2021] NSWSC 529 Johnson J [2023] NSWCCA 252	PG (10%) Murder s.33 Sched: Assault Possess	<u>Indicative:</u> 40y NPP 30y 8y NPP 6y <u>Aggregate:</u> 44y NPP 33y	AA <u>Indicative:</u> 36y NPP 27y 8y NPP 6y <u>Aggregate:</u> 40y NPP 30y	Limited – breached conditional liberty – subsequent custodial offences	Stabbed Intent to kill	SNPP 20 years Travelled from home suburb to city with intent to kill - booked escort and upon arrival at unit fatally stabbed female victim, filmed scene and sent footage to friends – donned balaclava to engender fear and ran through city streets brandishing knife – attempted to stab one female then stabbed second female in shoulder – subdued by civilians – several days earlier had assaulted sister in family home during argument Turkish / Cypriot background – mental health issues since 14y but treatment resistant – at time of offending suffering mental disorder which did not impede capacity – no major depressive illness – obsessed with mass killings and violent, interactive fantasy games - dangerous man – importance of community protection – expressed desire to die at hands of police of limited mitigating value Declined to impose life sentence because of mental health issues – no double counting in setting determinate term On appeal: error found in failure to consider impact of mental health issues on custodial conditions

This table has been prepared by the Public Defenders as a guide. Individual cases should be read if they are to be relied upon.

	NAME (age if known)	PLEA	SENTENCE	APPEAL	SUMMARY OF RECORD	HOW KILLED	INVOLVEMENT & SUMMARY
5.	SPINKS (33) [2021] NSWSC 649 Hamill J	VG (5% discount for trial conduct)	20y 10m NPP 15y 7m		Record includes drugs, BES and assault offences – serious subsequent offences	Shooting Intent to kill	SNPP 20 years Nine days prior to killing victim threatened offender with knife in offender's home – several days later offender observed driving past victim's car parked at friend's house – just before 2.10am drove past car again and fired shots striking victim standing next to car – pre-meditated – planning – public place – presence of victim's partner in front seat – upper end of mid-range – aggravated by use of 12-gauge shotgun – element of provocation – affected by PTSD from unrelated violent assault 6 months earlier High degree of pre-trial disclosure – mental health issues justified significant reduction in moral culpability - long term drug abuse - delay
6.	DXH (a pseudonym) [2021] NSWSC 849 Harrison J [2023] NSWCCA 140	VG (25% discount assistance)	14y NPP 10y 6m	AD		Shot Joint criminal enterprise	SNPP 20 years Joint criminal enterprise - co-offender received a call that his associate had been assaulted by deceased - co-offender told applicant that he wanted to "go talk to this bloke" – applicant went with co-offender to deceased's apartment - saw co-offender had a handgun – offender unarmed - both entered apartment wearing latex gloves and faces covered - co-offender shot deceased, who later died in hospital - two days later, offender rang police – told them of involvement in shooting. Voluntary disclosure – assistance. CCA: No error with regard to discount or with respect to matters relating to voluntary disclosure.

This table has been prepared by the Public Defenders as a guide. Individual cases should be read if they are to be relied upon.

	NAME (age if known)	PLEA	SENTENCE	APPEAL	SUMMARY OF RECORD	HOW KILLED	INVOLVEMENT & SUMMARY
7.	<p>HOPKINSON (18y 10m)</p> <p>ROBERTSON (18y 8m)</p> <p>[2021] NSWSC 861 Ierace J</p> <p>[2022] NSWCCA 80</p>	<p>PG (25%)</p> <p>PG (45% combined)</p>	<p>12y 9m NPP 8y 3m</p> <p>13y 2m NPP 9y</p>	Crown AD	nil	<p>Assault / constructive / extended JCE</p> <p>Assault / intent to kill / JCE</p>	<p>SNPP 25 years 17y victim detained in home of offenders over 8 hours – subjected to severe beating by co-accused S and fatally stabbed by S – offence aggravated by use of weapon and commission in company H watched assault and on several occasions took responsibility to keep victim detained – assisted in concealing offence – mid range seriousness R asleep during initial assault – later helped detain victim in car and assaulted victim to head with cricket bat to ‘put him out of his misery’ – non-exculpatory duress - above mid-range H – difficult childhood – some mental health issues – genuine remorse – very good prospects of rehabilitation R – unusually immature – high prospects of rehabilitation – genuine remorse – prior good character - assistance On appeal: sentences light but not manifestly inadequate – discussion as to SNPP where age gap between victim and offenders small</p>
8.	<p>CHATIMBA (No.2) (34)</p> <p>[2021] NSWSC 863 Wright J</p>	<p>VG Murder</p> <p>AOABH</p>	<p>21y NPP 15y 9m</p> <p>s.10A</p>		<p>Limited – no violence – breached bond for minor offence</p>	<p>Stabbing</p> <p>Intent GBH</p>	<p>SNPP 20 years While visiting ex-partner offender had several phone calls with male friend (victim) – both became angry – offender threw phone at ex-partner causing injury to face – victim arrived at residential street intoxicated – confrontation outside house between victim and offender – offender stabbed victim six times – impulsive offence – somewhat below mid-range Born in Zimbabwe – prior good character – suffering PTSD and depression – low likelihood of re-offending – good prospects of rehabilitation – genuine remorse</p>

This table has been prepared by the Public Defenders as a guide. Individual cases should be read if they are to be relied upon.

	NAME (age if known)	PLEA	SENTENCE	APPEAL	SUMMARY OF RECORD	HOW KILLED	INVOLVEMENT & SUMMARY
9.	<p>EVANS, K (24)</p> <p>EVANS, J (49)</p> <p>XE (17)</p> <p>[2021] NSWSC 885 Ierace J</p> <p>(XE) [2023] NSWCCA 96</p>	<p>VG Murder</p> <p>Wound with intent cause GBH</p> <p>Murder</p> <p>Murder</p>	<p><u>Indicative:</u> 30y NPP 21y</p> <p>6y NPP 4y 6m</p> <p><u>Aggregate:</u> 32y NPP 22y 4m</p> <p>31y NPP 22y 6m</p> <p>17y NPP 10y 6m</p>	AD	<p>Assault, destroy property, contravene AVO - on bonds</p> <p>Contravene AVO, stalking, resist police, threats of violence, violence.</p> <p>Reckless wounding, detain for advantage, AOABH</p>	<p>Shot</p> <p>Intent to kill - KE</p> <p>Accessory – JE / XE</p>	<p>SNPP 20 years</p> <p>Co-offenders involved in car chase following argument - JE father to KE and XE - JE drove car – XE in back seat – KE shot and killed victim.</p> <p>KE - discharged shotgun with intention of killing an occupant in other vehicle – shot victim multiple times to neck, throat, arms – 110 bullets in victim’s body - assaulted another victim on previous day – at mid-point between mid-range and maximum level of objective seriousness</p> <p>JE - joint criminal enterprise – drove and positioned vehicle alongside victim’s vehicle; aware KE had discharged firearm earlier - failure to intervene when KE aimed shotgun at car occupants at head and chest level at virtually point blank range - objective seriousness slightly higher than KE given his leading role and involvement of his own children - prospects of rehabilitation guarded</p> <p>XE – female of Aboriginal background - joint criminal enterprise – gestured victims’ vehicle immediately after shooting - telephone conversation shortly after indicated awareness occupant fatally injured and approved that outcome - objective seriousness below mid-level given youth and role father played in encouraging her to join enterprise – prospects of rehabilitation very good</p>
10.	<p>REAY (No.2) (47)</p> <p>[2021] NSWSC 901 RA Hulme J</p>	VG	30y NPP 22y 6m		Lengthy record for violence – offence committed on Extended Detention Order	<p>Strangulation</p> <p>Intent to kill</p>	<p>SNPP 20y</p> <p>Strangled cell mate – no explanation – spontaneous offence – vulnerable victim - very grave</p> <p>Violent childhood – early drug use – ‘long demonstrated propensity for unprovoked and on occasion indiscriminate violence in custody and in the community’ – severe personality disorder</p>

This table has been prepared by the Public Defenders as a guide. Individual cases should be read if they are to be relied upon.

	NAME (age if known)	PLEA	SENTENCE	APPEAL	SUMMARY OF RECORD	HOW KILLED	INVOLVEMENT & SUMMARY
11.	DION (41) [2021] NSWSC 1043 Beech-Jones J	VG	25y NPP 18y 9m		Nil Australia – minor offences in USA	Assault Intent to kill	SNPP 20y Lured drug dealer to car park with intent to use violence to steal drugs – during assault developed intent to kill and used weapon – victim died of head injuries – body dumped at side of road aggravating offence – attempted to cover up offence – mid-range Difficult childhood in Lebanon including sexual assault as a child – good character – unlikely to re-offend – prospects of rehabilitation – co-operation in trial process
12.	TAUMALOLO (18) [2021] NSWSC 1412 Davies J	PG	18y 10m NPP 14y 1m		Nil – dealt with for assaults on remand	Assault Intent GBH Joint criminal enterprise	SNPP 20y Group of youths fatally assaulted 18y male victim outside party – victim kicked, punched and stomped to head and face for several minutes while defenceless on ground – part of joint criminal enterprise to inflict GBH – did not know victim or reason for assault – vicious and unprovoked attack – spontaneous – gratuitous violence – main perpetrator – in company – under influence of drugs and alcohol – slightly below mid-range Some difficulties in childhood – low intellectual functioning – substance abuse since early teens – remorse – limited insight – reasonable prospects of rehabilitation – low risk of re-offending – relevance of youth but also general deterrence Co-offenders sentenced for manslaughter and affray
13.	DUKAGJINI (No.2) (30 at offence – 65 at sentence) [2021] NSWSC 1668 Fagan J [2023] NSWCCA 210	VG	20y NPP 13y	AD	Record for housebreaking – no other violence	Strangled and assaulted	(1986) Broke into residential house and surprised by female occupant – panicked and killed victim with electrical cord and piece of wood – killing aggravated by being in home of victim Albanian – no risk of violent re-offending – long period of no offending On appeal: no error in refusal to apply s.22A facilitation of justice discount

This table has been prepared by the Public Defenders as a guide. Individual cases should be read if they are to be relied upon.

	NAME (age if known)	PLEA	SENTENCE	APPEAL	SUMMARY OF RECORD	HOW KILLED	INVOLVEMENT & SUMMARY
14.	GARVEY (24)	PG (10%) Murder	28y 9m NPP 20y 3m		Lengthy – commenced at 11y – includes violence and robbery – breached parole and bail – shocking record of custodial breaches – existing sentence for dangerous driving causing death	Multiple incision wounds with machete during robbery Extended joint criminal enterprise (J)	SNPP 20y Offenders attended home of 60y male victim impersonating police officers – grabbed victim’s wallet containing \$1000 – later that day recruited co-offender – returned to victim’s house during night disguised and armed with baseball bat and machete – in confrontation with two of three male occupants victim cut multiple times with machete by G – fatal wound to upper arm – targeted home invasion for robbery – brutal assault – G primary offender – J involved in planning and aware of machete – more culpable than third offender – murder slightly above mid-range for J – more serious for G G – Aboriginal heritage – Bugmy principles applied – poor education – behavioural issues as a child – exposure to drug abuse and violence – foster care and homelessness – long history of personal substance abuse commencing at 11y – sexual abuse – never employed – possibly institutionalised – relevance of totality in light of existing sentence J – difficult childhood – drug user – mental health issue – some discount for assistance at trial
		Steal from person	13m				
		Impersonate police	9m <u>Aggregate:</u> 29y 3m NPP 20y 9m <u>Total including existing sent:</u> 34y 3m NPP 25y 9m				
	JONES (23) [2021] NSWSC 1147 RA Hulme J	VG Murder	28y NPP 21y 6m		Lengthy – includes domestic violence, robbery and driving offences – breached bond and parole		
		PG Steal from person	13m				
		Impersonate police	9m				
		Driving offence	9m <u>Aggregate:</u> 28y 9m NPP 22y 3m				
	Co-offender: FLETCHER [2020]						

This table has been prepared by the Public Defenders as a guide. Individual cases should be read if they are to be relied upon.

	NAME (age if known)	PLEA	SENTENCE	APPEAL	SUMMARY OF RECORD	HOW KILLED	INVOLVEMENT & SUMMARY
15.	LUO (31)	VG Murder	<u>Indicative</u> 24y NPP 17y		Record for drugs and violence – breached bail	Shooting Joint criminal enterprise	SNPP 20y Offences took place in context of organised crime involving drug dealing – offenders involved in supply of 56g ice prior to shooting – lower range - offenders approached Buddhist 'temple' with intent to use firearm to intimidate male acquaintance in relation to drug debt – Luo and Liu entered premises – in subsequent argument formed intent to kill and Liu fatally shot bystander then shot at fleeing acquaintance – Fan present outside temple as part of joint criminal enterprise to intimate – poorly executed plan that escalated LUO – planned but unexplained shooting at house three days prior to killing – mid range - murder and attempted murder towards upper end of mid-range – difficult childhood with neglect and early drug abuse – limited reduction to culpability LIU – actual shooter for murder and attempt murder but similar culpability to LUO – upper end of mid-range – less substantial record and some prospects of rehabilitation FAN – significantly lesser criminality for offences although still serious – lower mid-range – good prospects of rehabilitation and unlikely to re-offend – health issues – isolation in custody
		Att murder	12y NPP 8y				
		PG (5%) s.93GA	5y 6m NPP 3y				
		Supply	9.5m				
			<u>Aggregate:</u> 30y NPP 20y				
	LIU (33)	VG Murder	<u>Indicative</u> 24y NPP 17y		Lesser sentence – minor drug and violence		
		Att murder	12y NPP 8y				
		PG (10%) Supply	9m				
			<u>Aggregate:</u> 28y NPP 19y				
FAN (45) [2021] NSWSC 1500 Hamill J	VG Murder	<u>Indicative</u> 20y NPP 15y		Limited record			
	Att murder	10y NPP 7y					
	PG (5%) Supply	9.5m					
		<u>Aggregate:</u> 22y NPP 16y 6m					

This table has been prepared by the Public Defenders as a guide. Individual cases should be read if they are to be relied upon.

	NAME (age if known)	PLEA	SENTENCE	APPEAL	SUMMARY OF RECORD	HOW KILLED	INVOLVEMENT & SUMMARY
16.	ARCHER (49) [2021] NSWSC 1485 Hamill J	VG	19y 6m NPP 13y 6m		Five offences – 2 personal violence offences although old	Stabbing Intent GBH	SNPP 20y Carrying knife in unit block when came across male acquaintance – angered by belief victim had broken into offender's unit and stolen personal property – in fight stabbed victim once in back – aggressor but stabbing not pre- meditated – comfortably below range Reasonable prospects of rehabilitation – 2.5% discount for assistance in trial – onerous conditions of custody due to poor health and Covid restrictions
17.	SULTANI (27) MUNSHIZADA (27-28) [2021] NSWSC 1654 Fagan J Co-offenders: BAINES DANISHYAR	PG 3 x Murder VG 3 x Murder	Life Life		Drug and violence offences	Shooting Intent to kill	SNPP 20y Three unrelated killings over nine month period – shot dead drug dealer outside his home on street late at night after arranging drug deal – S and M both fired shots – motive unclear but linked to organised criminal activity – 7 months later shot dead second drug dealer standing by his car with finance waiting inside – victim lured to trap - S fired from car then alighted and pursued victim to fire additional shots – M drove car - possible contract killing – final victim shot dead 9 weeks later – S believed victim, an underworld figure, involved in killing of offender's close friend – S and co- offender B shot victim while M drove – D aware of plan to kill and drove second getaway car - each killing carefully planned, merciless and committed in residential streets – all offenders part of inner circle of criminal organisation S – principal planner - dangerous to community – 'demonstrated readiness to kill for no cause' – no remorse – no positive prospects of rehabilitation M – similar culpability to S – willing participant with knowledge of intended offences – dysfunctional childhood – no remorse and no positive prospects of rehabilitation

This table has been prepared by the Public Defenders as a guide. Individual cases should be read if they are to be relied upon.

	NAME (age if known)	PLEA	SENTENCE	APPEAL	SUMMARY OF RECORD	HOW KILLED	INVOLVEMENT & SUMMARY
18.	<p>BAINES (23-24)</p> <p>DANISHYAR (23)</p> <p>[2021] NSWSC 1654 Fagan J</p> <p>[2023] NSWCCA 302 [2023] NSWCCA 300</p> <p>Co-offenders: SULTANI MUNSHIZADA</p>	<p>VG Murder</p> <p>VG Accessory before the fact to murder</p> <p>Accessory after the fact to murder</p>	<p>36y NPP 27y</p> <p>15y NPP 11y</p> <p>FT 2y</p>	<p>AA 22y 6m NPP 7y 6m</p> <p>Crown AA 20y NPP 15y</p>	<p>One prior offence of violence – prison offences</p>	<p>Shot</p> <p>Intent to kill</p>	<p>SNPP 20y (Baines only) Involved in last of three killings committed by co-offenders - all offenders part of inner circle of criminal organisation – co-offender S believed victim, an underworld figure, involved in killing of close friend – S and B shot victim while co-offender M drove – D aware of plan to kill and drove second getaway car - killing carefully planned, merciless and committed in residential street B – motivated by desire to ingratiate with co-offenders – subordinate to co-offenders and influenced by them – dysfunctional childhood although no link to offending D – knew about plan to kill when accepted role of second getaway driver – M's cousin – no remorse – no positive prospects of rehabilitation – risk of re-offending</p>

This table has been prepared by the Public Defenders as a guide. Individual cases should be read if they are to be relied upon.