

| |
|---|
| Murder Home Invasion / Break and Enter |
|---|

Maximum Penalty: Life (s.19A (NSW) Crimes Act)

Standard non-parole period (offences committed on or after 1.2.2003)

20 years

25 years - Where the victim was a police officer, emergency services worker, correctional officer, judicial officer, health worker, teacher, community worker, or other public official, exercising public or community functions and the offence arose because of the victim's occupation or voluntary work

Standard non-parole period (where conviction entered or plea of guilty made on or after 1.1.2008)

25 years - Where the victim a child under 18 years of age

| | NAME (age if known) | PLEA | SENTENCE | APPEAL | RECORD | HOW KILLED | INVOLVEMENT & SUMMARY |
|----|--|---|-----------------|--------|---|---|--|
| 1. | CALLEJA (17) NSWSC 19.7.1991 Slattery AJ | VG Murder PG Rob 2 x Obtain by deception | MT 15y AT 5y | | long record armed robbery, kidnapping | strangulation reckless indifference | Robbery - tied elderly lady up in house - took chequebook and withdrew money. Escapee at time of offence. |
| 2. | O'HELLO (23) NSWSC 31.3.1992 Finlay J | VG Murder Enter dwell w/i and armed | MT 12y AT 4y | | steal, malicious damage | shooting | Shotgun robbery at private home |

This table has been prepared by the Public Defenders as a guide. Individual cases should be read if they are to be relied upon.

| | NAME (age if known) | PLEA | SENTENCE | APPEAL | RECORD | HOW KILLED | INVOLVEMENT & SUMMARY |
|----|---|---|-----------------------|--------------------------------------|--|-------------------------------|---|
| 3. | LIVERMORE (46) NSWSC Hunt CJ at CL 30.11.1992 NSWCCA 2.3.1995 Co-offender: JERRARD | VG | MT 12y 6m AT 4y 2m | Convict AD | lengthy - property offences, child sex assault, assault | assault | Bashed to death an old man after trying to steal his car. Sentence cumulative to existing sentence for sexual offences |
| 4. | JERRARD (21) NSWSC 21.12.1992 Hunt CJ at CL Co-offender: LIVERMORE | PG | MT 9y AT 3y | | Record for mal damage, assaults, BES, unlawful use of motor vehicles | Assault Intent GBH | Assaulted male occupant of house while stealing car – extraordinary injuries – left victim tied up Aboriginal |
| 5. | RYAN (29) NSWSC 7.5.1993 Abadee J (1995) 90 A Crim R 191 | PG Murder Steal from dwelling Steal car | MT 14y AT 6y | AD | | cut throat | Broke into neighbour's unit and cut his throat with a knife - later stole goods and car Had been drinking heavily. |
| 6. | O'BRIEN (19) NSWCCA 10.6.1993 | PG | MT 10y AT 6y | Crown AA MT 12y AT 6y | BES – stealing – AOABH - mal damage | shooting felony murder | Entered bedroom with loaded rifle and shot victim when challenged. Crown appeal - withdrew offer to assist |
| 7. | LORENZO (33) NSWSC 26.11.1993 Dunford J NSWCCA 22.5.1995 [2001] NSWCCA 389 | VG | MT 17y AT 5y 6m | Conviction AD Sentence AD | serious | assault / strangulation | Robbery and murder of female in her home Some assistance to authorities. |

This table has been prepared by the Public Defenders as a guide. Individual cases should be read if they are to be relied upon.

| | NAME (age if known) | PLEA | SENTENCE | APPEAL | RECORD | HOW KILLED | INVOLVEMENT & SUMMARY |
|-----|--|--|--|--------|--|----------------------------|--|
| 8. | RICHARDSON (28) NSWSC 28.2.1994 Finlay J | PG (after voir dire) | MT 20y AT Life | | lengthy - manslaughter, sexual assault on woman & young boys | assault / burning | Broke into house and raped 29y old female acquaintance in front of her young children, abducted her, bashed her with piece of wood then set fire to her body. |
| 9. | BROUGHTON (29) NSWSC 30.5.1994 Smart J | PG | MT 14y AT 6y | | extensive priors including gaol | stabbing | Broke into house believing it to be empty - stabbed 54y female occupant eight times Full admissions - on protection |
| 10. | PREVITERA (1997) 94 A Crim R 76 NSWSC 27.5.1997 Hunt CJ at CL | PG | MT 20y AT 5y | | long record, including bag snatch on elderly woman | strangulation | Strangled 81y female neighbour, then robbed her - motive for murder unclear. |
| 11. | LITTLE (30) NSWSC - 17.10.1997 Hidden J | PG | MT 11y AT 5y | | minor | stabbed intent kill | Broke into home of friend's neighbour and stabbed male occupant - no reason for violent outburst – returned some time later to set fire to flat with body inside. Aboriginal offender. Alcohol. |
| 12. | HOKER (17) [1999] NSWSC 896 Barr J | PG Murder Rob with violence Rob with violence | MT 7y AT 6y FT 3y MT 3y AT 2y Total: MT 10y AT 6y | | drug related offences | stabbing | Went to flat to purchase heroin with six friends – victim stabbed in chest three times with knife found at flat. Prospects of rehabilitation. |

This table has been prepared by the Public Defenders as a guide. Individual cases should be read if they are to be relied upon.

| | NAME (age if known) | PLEA | SENTENCE | APPEAL | RECORD | HOW KILLED | INVOLVEMENT & SUMMARY |
|-----|--|----------------------------|---|----------------------------|--|---|---|
| 13. | D PRIVETT (27) M PRIVETT (29) [1999] NSWSC 1076 B-Parker AJ (D Privett) [2001] NSWCCA 518 | VG | MT 14y 6m AT 3y 3m MT 11y AT 3y 8m | AA 17y 9m NPP 13y 4m | minor long record reflecting trouble childhood | shooting intent kill common purpose or joint criminal enterprise | Shot victim during robbery at property - no premeditation - D fired fatal shot at close range and greater culpability |
| 14. | HARRIS (30) (2000) 111 A Crim R 415 [2000] NSWSC 285 Bell J (2000) 121 A Crim R 342 [2000] NSWCCA 469 | PG 3 x Murder AR | 40y NPP 25y | Crown AA Life | not serious | strangulation intent kill | Three killings committed in one month - strangled male suffering effects of stroke in victim's home - strangled intellectually disabled woman he befriended in her home - strangled male neighbour and disposed of body in country - second and third killings motivated by desire to kill –elderly, sick, or disadvantaged victims – betrayal of trust – two killings an exercise of power and to exact revenge on society |
| 15. | DARGIN (24) [2000] NSWSC 710 Ireland J | PG | 19y NPP 14y | | long history of dishonesty and violence - on bail at time of offence | assault intent GBH | Bashed 72y female to death in her home - brutal sexual assault - initial motivation was robbery. Aboriginal offender. |

This table has been prepared by the Public Defenders as a guide. Individual cases should be read if they are to be relied upon.

| | NAME (age if known) | PLEA | SENTENCE | APPEAL | RECORD | HOW KILLED | INVOLVEMENT & SUMMARY |
|-----|--|--|---|----------------------------|---|------------------------------------|---|
| 16. | HYLAND (27) PARRY (35) YATES (28) [2001] NSWSC 470 Ireland AJ [2002] NSWCCA 520 | VG Murder s.111(3) Murder s.111(3) Murder s.111(3) | 23y NPP 17y 3m FT 11y (concurrent) 26y NPP 19y FT 11y (concurrent) 20y NPP 15y FT 10y (concurrent) | Conviction and sentence AD | prior record lengthy record including violence insignificant record | shooting intent to kill | Group of men forced way into residential house and terrorised occupants inside with baseball bat, revolver and shortened shotgun - occupants assaulted with bat - victim executed at close range with bullet behind ear - other occupants shown body and threatened - worst class of case but level of culpability not so extreme that community interest only met through life imprisonment P shot victim in presence of Y Y a follower with limited intellectual functioning and back injury. |
| 17. | WRIGHT (25) [2001] NSWSC 1050 Adams J | PG Sched: Aggravated Rob with Wounding | 22y NPP 15y 6m | | | Stabbing Intent to kill | Stabbed middle aged woman in own home - broke into home intending to rob victim - killed victim to prevent identification - previously worked for victim and husband - premeditated, cowardly and brutal attack. Troubled childhood - some prospects of rehabilitation - relative immaturity |
| 18. | WHITFIELD (17) [2001] NSWSC 876 Adams J [2002] NSWCCA 501 | VG | 20y NPP 13y | Conviction and sentence AD | lengthy criminal record | stabbing intent GBH | Went armed with knives to victim's house with three others to commit robbery - stabbed victim three times probably in panic to escape. Disturbed and troubled childhood displaying early signs of behavioural difficulties - aboriginal. |
| 19. | SYMSS (24) [2001] NSWSC 1037 Howie J [2003] NSWCCA 77 | VG Murder Rob w/ wounding LMV | 22y NPP 16y 6m FT 5y FT 2y (all concurrent) | Conviction AD | priors including armed robbery | suffocation intent to kill | Suffocated 73y female in own home during robbery - attempted to stab victim in neck No remorse |

This table has been prepared by the Public Defenders as a guide. Individual cases should be read if they are to be relied upon.

| | NAME (age if known) | PLEA | SENTENCE | APPEAL | RECORD | HOW KILLED | INVOLVEMENT & SUMMARY |
|-----|--|--|---|--------|--|-------------------------------------|---|
| 20. | SLD (13y 10m) [2002] NSWSC 758 Wood CJ at CL (2003) 142 A Crim R 503 [2003] NSWCCA 310 | PG | 20y NPP 10y | AD | | stabbing intent to kill | Broke into neighbouring home at night and abducted 3y sleeping girl - removed clothes and stabbed her in chest once - discarded body in long grass - misled police during inquiries - callous and cold-blooded killing - motive unclear Seriously affected by background of upheaval, abuse and lack of emotional support - intellectual and speech disability and dysmorphic appearance - sexually abused by half-brother - disturbed individual - history of aggressive and unacceptable behaviour - significant level of future dangerousness, although difficult to assess at this stage |
| 21. | STONE (31 at offence / 44 at sentence) (2004) 144 A Crim R 568 [2004] NSWSC 224 Grove J | PG | 21y NPP 15y 9m | | Lengthy – breached parole – dealt with for attempt to commit similar offence 5 years later | Strangulation | (1990) Broke into home during day attempting to escape pursuit – intoxicated and drug affected – formed intent to commit sexual assault – stripped female occupant and tied her to bed – strangled with football sock – gratuitous violence - 5 years later threatened 26y daughter of de facto with similar violence – subsequent DNA match to murder Deprived childhood as ward of state – serious health problems – future dangerousness – more lenient sentence pattern for murder at time of offence |
| 22. | LOEBER (33) [2004] NSWSC 293 Wood CJ at CL | PG (combined 25%) | 18y NPP 13y | | No relevant priors | Stabbing | Broke into home of female friend and stabbed her over 40 times – disguised with pillowcase upon entering house – no memory of offence - use of knife and attack in complainant's home aggravating features Prior good character |
| 23. | EM (19) [2005] NSWSC 212 James J | VG: Murder s 97(2) s 93G(1)(c) PG 5 x s 97(2) | 25y NPP 16y FT 10y FT 2y FT 12y Total: 36y NPP 27y | AD | Driving offences | Shooting Constructive murder | Home invasion with co-offender – 5 occupants forced to lie on floor – victim shot and killed in struggle – victim's wife shot in thumb – 10 days later, similar offence with 2 co-offenders - robbery completed and 5 occupants left tied up in house Cambodian – poly substance abuse – mood disorder |

This table has been prepared by the Public Defenders as a guide. Individual cases should be read if they are to be relied upon.

| | NAME (age if known) | PLEA | SENTENCE | APPEAL | RECORD | HOW KILLED | INVOLVEMENT & SUMMARY |
|-----|---|--|--|------------------|---|---|---|
| 24. | VILLA (36) [2005] NSWCCA 4 | VG 2 x Murder 3 x Attempt murder | Life | AD | Minor | Shooting / Stabbing / Strangulation Intent to kill | Entered home to collect debt – tied up adults – shot male – shot, stabbed and strangled female – shot child in head twice – set fire to house to kill three children – attempt to avoid detection |
| 25. | HILLSLEY (53) [2005] NSWSC 652 Hidden J (2006) 164 A Crim R 252 [2006] NSWCCA 312 | PG (25%) Murder 4 x Agg sexual ass Kidnapping | 16y NPP 12y <u>Total:</u> 30y NPP 25y | Crown AA Life | Paedophile offences | Hammer Intent to inflict GBH | SNPP 20 years Broke into house of male acquaintance and killed sleeping victim – earlier argument over money - sexually abused victim's 10y step-daughter and abducted her 'as payback' – sexually abused her a few days earlier – offences part of single act of terrible vengeance Unfortunate upbringing – irresistible impulses for young girls – risk to community – gambling problem – escaped from custody though at large for only one day |
| 26. | WHITE (34) [2005] NSWSC 667 Studdert J | PG (10%) Sched: 5 Break and enter offences | 24y NPP 18y | | Dishonesty and violence – breached bail | Assault / asphyxiation Reckless indifference | SNPP 20 years Broke into home of 82y widow – victim assaulted, bound and gagged – believed victim would die if not found Aboriginal with disrupted childhood and drug addiction |
| 27. | CB (22) IM (23) [2006] NSWSC 261 Buddin J | PG (See facts) Murder s.33 Sched: 3 offences PG (See facts) Murder s.33 Sched: 2 offences | 18y NPP 13y FT 7y <u>Total</u> 20y NPP 15y 21y 6m NPP 15y 6m FT 8y <u>Total</u> 24y NPP 18y | | Priors for violence Priors for violence – breached conditional liberty | Assault Intent GBH | SNPP 20 years Two offenders assaulted male acquaintance in own unit – planned attempt to rob – victim suffered brain damage – fatal assault on second male who arrived unexpectedly at unit CB – history of sexual assault resulting in drug addiction – suffering drug induced psychotic illness – assistance in relation to perpetrator of sexual assault IM – disturbed childhood – sexually assaulted resulting in drug addiction Discount for guilty plea at or slightly above mid-point of range – CB combined discount – not specified – at least 15% for future assistance |

This table has been prepared by the Public Defenders as a guide. Individual cases should be read if they are to be relied upon.

| | NAME (age if known) | PLEA | SENTENCE | APPEAL | RECORD | HOW KILLED | INVOLVEMENT & SUMMARY |
|-----|--|--|---|-------------------------|---|-------------------------------------|--|
| 28. | APPS [2006] NSWCCA 290 | PG (25%) Sched: BE&S | 27y NPP 20y 9m | AA 18y NPP 13y 6m | Dishonesty, possess knives, assault | Shooting Intent to kill | SNPP 20 years Acquainted with victim – broke into nearby farm stealing four guns – shot victim at victim’s home. Personality disorder |
| 29. | STEER (40) [2006] NSWSC 1198 Whealy J (2008) 191 A Crim R 435 [2008] NSWCCA 295 | VG Murder AR | 29y 4m NPP 22y FT 4y <u>Total</u> 31y 4m NPP 24y | AD | Lengthy | Stabbing Intent to kill | SNPP 20 years Broke into home and stabbed male occupant in neck – set fire to house with body inside – angered at relationship between deceased and ex-girlfriend – above mid-range offences – intent formed after entry to house – on separate occasion robbed bank Single parent with 4 children |
| 30. | JOHNSON (53) [2007] NSWSC 274 Whealy J [2010] NSWCCA 86 | VG 2 x Murder Dishonesty offences | Life | Conviction AD | Minor traffic | Strangulation Intent to kill | SNPP 20 years Tied up and strangled retired couple in their own home – trusted handyman – stole money from bank accounts – financial difficulties – well planned offence - cold, calculated killings with element of mental torture, fear and distress |
| 31. | DAVIS (26) [2008] NSWSC 55 Mathews AJ [2015] NSWCCA 90 | VG | 24y NPP 18y | AA 22y NPP 16y 6m | Lengthy – mal wounding under similar circumstances | Stabbing Intent GBH | SNPP 20 years Broke into apartment to steal property – stabbed male occupant in attempt to escape – victim died 3 days later from heart failure Disturbed and abusive childhood |
| 32. | WILSON (32) [2008] NSWSC 238 Howie J [2015] NSWCCA 128 | VG | 26y 6m NPP 20y | AA 21y 4m NPP 16y | Minor | Shooting Intent to kill | SNPP 20 years Attempted armed robbery on co-offender’s flatmate – flatmate recently obtained large amount of money from armed robbery – also a drug dealer - shot victim in head at close range – lost temper – killing not planned Aboriginal with violent and deprived childhood Co-offenders Fraser and Spencer dealt with for manslaughter [2007] NSWSC 1449 |

This table has been prepared by the Public Defenders as a guide. Individual cases should be read if they are to be relied upon.

| | NAME (age if known) | PLEA | SENTENCE | APPEAL | RECORD | HOW KILLED | INVOLVEMENT & SUMMARY |
|-----|--|--|---|--------|--|--|---|
| 33. | PEARCE (25) [2008] NSWSC 1434 Latham J | PG (no discount) | 20y NPP 15y | | Lengthy – no major violence | Stabbing Intent to kill | SNPP 20 years Arrived at friend's unit armed with knife - became involved in fight with male victim and stabbed in back – spontaneous offence – no assistance to victim – paranoid and highly aroused state from amphetamines – slightly below mid-range Appalling childhood marked by domestic violence – both parents heroin addicts – no education – early drug abuse |
| 34. | MCGUREN [2010] NSWSC 744 Fullerton J | PG | 34y NPP 25y 6m | | Lengthy. - attempt strangle, AOABH, breach AVO | Shooting and assault Intent to kill | SNPP 20 years Broke into home of ex-partner's new partner – shot victim in neck – bashed victim in head with rifle butt number of times causing death - premeditated – upper end of upper range of objective seriousness Tendency to uncontrolled violence. |
| 35. | DENNISON (28) [2010] NSWSC 780 Fullerton J | PG (20%) Murder 8 x s.61J 2 x s.61K(b) 4 x s.86(1)(b) s.35(2) s.113(2) 2 x s.97(1) Sched: 8 offences | 18y NPP 11y <u>Total:</u> 28y NPP 21y | | AOABH, possess knife, driving, resist police. | Fall No intent to kill | SNPP 20 years Followed four persons into security apartment – threatened with knife – forced sexual acts with three victims – murder victim escaped through balcony door and fell from balcony - died from injuries – another victim also sustained serious injuries after falling from balcony - lower end of mid-range – no intent to kill Aboriginal background – troubled background. drug dependent (“ice”) - capacity for exercising judgment was probably severely compromised by being in the grips of “ice” on the day of offence |
| 36. | DB (16) [2010] NSWSC 812 Barr AJ | PG Murder Wound w/l murder Sched Assault | 20y NPP 12y FT 12y <u>Total:</u> 24y NPP 16y | | nil | Stabbing Intent to kill | Broke into home of ex-girlfriend armed with carving knife at night – fatally stabbed father of ex-girlfriend in confrontation – stabbed mother in bedroom then pursued her outside and stabbed in back and continued to stab – taunted ex-girlfriend about killings, pushed her up against wall, slapped her face and forcefully kissed her on lips – disabled telephones Vindictively jealous and made numerous threats against various people before incident – otherwise prior good character – no mental illness – remarkable progress in gaol |

This table has been prepared by the Public Defenders as a guide. Individual cases should be read if they are to be relied upon.

| | NAME (age if known) | PLEA | SENTENCE | APPEAL | RECORD | HOW KILLED | INVOLVEMENT & SUMMARY |
|-----|---|-------------------------------------|---|---------------|----------------------|--------------------------------|---|
| 37. | ATAI (18) [2011] NSWSC 1617 Grove J [2014] NSWCCA 210 | VG | 24y NPP 18y | AD | Custodial record | Shooting Recklessness | SNPP 20 years Approached house with group of men – fired shots into front window of house killing occupant after being advised had wrong house – motive for approach to house and shooting unclear Afghani refugee with links to bikie gang |
| 38. | COTTERILL [2012] NSWSC 89 McCallum J | PG (15%) Murder Escape | 22y NPP 16y FT 6m <u>Total:</u> 22y NPP 16y 6m | | Offences of violence | Stabbing Intent to kill | SNPP 20 years Stabbed 19y female in her own home during day– prolonged attack - 27 stab wounds – confronted by victim after entering house with intention to steal – not premeditated Escaped from prison van several days after arrest by faking self-harm – ran six metres before shot in pelvic region and leg Dysfunctional childhood – severely disturbed as child and adolescent – violent and poor impulse control |
| 39. | SHAMOUN (24) [2012] NSWSC 716 Bellew J [2015] NSWCCA 256 | VG Murder Mal wound | 27y NPP 20y 12m NPP 9m <u>Total:</u> 27y NPP 20y 3m | AD | Nil significant | Stabbing Intent GBH | SNPP 20 years Broke into home at night and assaulted male victim in bed – wife injured in escape – victim stabbed in struggle – offence committed in response to request by co-offender to inflict serious injury on victim because of falling out over employment – not satisfied act committed for reward Iraqi – suffering brain injury |
| 40. | AMOS (20) [2012] NSWSC 1021 Hall J [2014] NSWCCA 302 | VG | 28y NPP 21y | Conviction AD | Nil | Shooting Intent to kill | SNPP 20 years Involved in armed robbery with co-offender of male drug dealer who owed money – formed intent to kill and shot victim eight times – returned to house with co-offender and stole property – victim shot in own home – only robbery planned – high level of culpability – committed for financial gain Deprived and neglected childhood |

This table has been prepared by the Public Defenders as a guide. Individual cases should be read if they are to be relied upon.

| | NAME (age if known) | PLEA | SENTENCE | APPEAL | RECORD | HOW KILLED | INVOLVEMENT & SUMMARY |
|-----|---|-----------------------------|---|--------|--|---|---|
| 41. | NATUBA (19) | PG (50%) Murder | 14y NPP 10y | | Agg robbery – breached bond. | Assault with meat cleaver / machete | SNPP 20 years Home invasions committed over three-day period with number of other young males - armed with meat cleavers - occupant at one home seriously injured - occupant of another house killed while resisting offenders N – threatened victim with cleaver T - organisational role – did not enter homes Each received discount for assistance to authorities - undertaking to give evidence against co-accused - youth – drug and alcohol abuse |
| | TAMAPUA (20) [2012] NSWSC 1569 Johnson J Co-Offenders: MA BYQUAR RAMOS KHOURY KARIMI MIR | AR Sched: Robbery | 5y NPP 3y 9m <u>Total:</u> 15y NPP 11y | | Robbery, assault, breach AVO - on bond | Joint criminal enterprise | |
| | | PG (50%) Murder | 14y NPP 10y | | | | |
| | | Sp Agg BES | 4y NPP 3y | | | | |
| | | Poss Firearm | 3y NPP 2y | | | | |
| | | Poss weapon | FT 2y | | | | |
| | | Sched: 3 x Robbery | <u>Total:</u> 15y 6m NPP 11y 6m | | | | |

This table has been prepared by the Public Defenders as a guide. Individual cases should be read if they are to be relied upon.

| | NAME (age if known) | PLEA | SENTENCE | APPEAL | RECORD | HOW KILLED | INVOLVEMENT & SUMMARY |
|------------------------------|---|---------------------------------|------------------------------------|-------------------------|---|--|--|
| 42. | MA (17) | PG (25%) Murder | 20y NPP 14y | | on bond. Stalking, intimidation, assault w.i rob in co. | Joint criminal enterprise. Wounded with meat cleaver / machete | SNPP 20 years Home invasions committed over three-day period with number of other young males - armed with meat cleavers - occupant at one home seriously injured - occupant of another house killed while resisting offenders. MA – did not strike victim but present - remorse, rehabilitation, maturity B – struck victim - drug / alcohol abuse - remorse R – outside house assisting – remorse, rehabilitation |
| | | Sp Agg BES | 5y 6m NPP 4y | | | | |
| | | AR | 5y 6m NPP 4y | | | | |
| | Sched: Consp rob AR | <u>Total:</u> 23y NPP 17y | | | | | |
| | BYQUAR (18) | PG (25%) Murder | 23y NPP 16y | | AOABH, Rob in co. | | |
| | | AR | 8y NPP 6y | | | | |
| | | Sched: AR | <u>Total:</u> 25y NPP 18y | | | | |
| | RAMOS (18) [2012] NSWSC 1527 Johnson J (Ramos) [2015] NSWCCA 313 Co-Accused: NATUBA TAMAPUA KHOURY KARIMI MIR | PG (25%) Murder | 17y NPP 12y | AA 14y 3m NPP 10y | Nil | | |
| | | Sp Agg BES | 4y NPP 3y | 4y NPP 3y | | | |
| | | AR | 5y 6m NPP 4y | 5y 6m NPP 4y | | | |
| Sched: Conspire rob AR | | <u>Total:</u> 19y NPP 14y | <u>Total:</u> 16y 3m NPP 12y | | | | |

This table has been prepared by the Public Defenders as a guide. Individual cases should be read if they are to be relied upon.

| | NAME (age if known) | PLEA | SENTENCE | APPEAL | RECORD | HOW KILLED | INVOLVEMENT & SUMMARY |
|-----|---|----------------------------|---|--------|--|---|---|
| 43. | SMITH (27) [2013] NSWSC 1159 Schmidt J Co-offenders: SMITH KENNEDY | PG (18%) | 22y 11m NPP 17y 2m | | Considerable record | Assault Intent GBH Joint criminal enterprise | SNPP 20 years Three men broke into home of 75y male occupant – severely assaulted in attempt to obtain access to safe – active participant in assault - left for nearly a day – joint criminal enterprise – moral culpability high Evidence of remorse - drug addicted – aboriginal – low intelligence – poor schooling |
| 44. | LOCKETT (27) [2013] NSWSC 1555 Price J Co-offender: BROWN | VG | 18y NPP 13y | | Drugs and weapons – breached conditional liberty – no violence | Shooting Intent GBH | SNPP 20 years Part of group of males who assaulted victim outside his home - given gun by B but thought it was a pole - struck victim on head with gun and it discharged killing victim – cowardly attack by group – no intent to kill – spontaneous offence – did not know weapon was a gun and did not know gun loaded – below middle of range – equal culpability to B Remorse – special circumstances: need for drug counselling – some prospects of rehabilitation. Co-offenders <i>Tuivaga</i> and <i>Barnes</i> sentenced for manslaughter |
| 45. | BROWN (27) [2013] NSWSC 1557 Price J [2015] NSWCCA 11 Co-offender: LOCKETT | VG | 19y NPP 13y 9m | AD | Reckless wounding in company – murder committed on bail for these offences | Shooting Joint criminal enterprise | SNPP 20 years Initiator of confrontation - gave loaded shotgun to L – with four offenders confronted male next door over sale of pistol – encouraged and participated in assault – threatened female - male struck over head with gun by L – L unaware loaded shotgun - gun discharged killing victim – cowardly attack by group – no intent to kill – spontaneous offence – equal culpability to L – below middle of range No remorse and no finding as to rehabilitation prospects – difficult family background Co-offenders <i>Tuivaga</i> and <i>Barnes</i> sentenced for manslaughter |
| 46. | SMITH (26) [2013] NSWSC 1723 Barr AJ Co-offenders: SMITH KENNEDY | PG Murder 2 x AR | 20y NPP 14y 8y NPP 6y <u>Total:</u> 23y NPP 17y | | Property offences related to drug problem – breached parole | Assault Joint criminal enterprise | SNPP 20 years Involved in breaking into home of elderly victim - sustained assault on male occupant by co-offender – acted as lookout - left victim to die - on earlier occasion broke into home with two co-offenders and assaulted male occupant – forced female occupant to ATM to withdraw money – threats made Aboriginal with difficult childhood – early drug and alcohol abuse Discount for guilty plea at bottom of range |

This table has been prepared by the Public Defenders as a guide. Individual cases should be read if they are to be relied upon.

| | NAME (age if known) | PLEA | SENTENCE | APPEAL | RECORD | HOW KILLED | INVOLVEMENT & SUMMARY |
|-----|---|---|--|--------|----------------------------|---|--|
| 47. | BELL (27) [2013] NSWSC 1838 Hall J | PG (10%) Murder s97(2) s33(1)(a) | 25y 4m NPP 19y 5y NPP 3y 9m 10y NPP 7y 6m <u>Total:</u> 27y NPP 21y 6m | | Rob in co, AOABH, drugs | Shooting Constructive murder | SNPP 20 years Home invasion with co-offender to obtain money and drugs – armed with firearms – during struggle accidentally shot in face by co-offender – offender discharged his firearm killing male aged 17y – co-offender shot and injured second male - intent to inflict injury for purpose of effecting escape - did not form intent to shoot until very shortly before fatal shot fired Left school Year 8 – learning difficulties - long standing personal problems including drug use and anti-social personality characteristics - no link established between anti-social personality disorder and any abusive or deprived upbringing |
| 48. | KARIMI (22) [2013] NSWSC 1761 Johnson J Co-offenders: KHOURY MIR NATUBA TAMAPUA MA BYQUAR RAMOS | VG Murder Conspiracy AR s.112(3) 2 x AR Conspiracy to murder Possess firearm | 24y NPP 17y 6y NPP 4y 8y NPP 6y 10y NPP 7y 12y NPP 9y 4y NPP 3y <u>Total:</u> 37y NPP 30y | | Limited | Assault with meat cleavers Joint criminal enterprise Intent to kill | SNPP 20 years Home invasions committed over three-day period by young males armed with meat cleavers linked to drug dealing - occupant at one home seriously injured - occupant of another house killed with meat cleaver while resisting offenders – planned to engage subsequent fight to death Karimi significant role in organisation -Afghani |

This table has been prepared by the Public Defenders as a guide. Individual cases should be read if they are to be relied upon.

| | NAME (age if known) | PLEA | SENTENCE | APPEAL | RECORD | HOW KILLED | INVOLVEMENT & SUMMARY |
|-----|--|---|--|--------|--------|---|---|
| 49. | KHOURY (29) [2013] NSWSC 1761 Johnson J Co-offenders: KARIMI MIR NATUBA TAMAPUA MA BYQUAR RAMOS | VG Murder Consp AR Possess firearm s.112(3) Recruit to commit AR AR AR x 2 Conspiracy to murder | 26y NPP 18y 6y NPP 4y 4y NPP 3y 10y NPP 7y FT 3y 10y NPP 7y 11y NPP 7y 12y NPP 9y <u>Total:</u> 40y NPP 32y | | Minor | Assault with meat cleavers Joint criminal enterprise Intent to kill | SNPP 20 years Home invasions committed over three-day period by young males armed with meat cleavers linked to drug dealing - occupant at one home seriously injured - occupant of another house killed with meat cleaver while resisting offenders – planned to engage subsequent fight to death Khoury effective leader of organisation involved in drug dealing – continued to plan criminal activity after murder - Lebanese |
| 50. | MIR (20) [2013] NSWSC 1761 Johnson J [2022] NSWCCA 132 Co-offenders: KARIMI KHOURY NATUBA TAMAPUA MA BYQUAR RAMOS | VG Murder AR AR | 26y NPP 19y 10y NPP 7y 11y NPP 7y <u>Total:</u> 31y NPP 24y | AD | Minor | Assault with meat cleavers Joint criminal enterprise Intent to kill | SNPP 20 years Home invasions committed over three-day period by young males armed with meat cleavers linked to drug dealing - occupant at one home seriously injured - occupant of another house killed with meat cleaver while resisting offenders – planned to engage subsequent fight to death Mir – foot soldiers - Afghani |

This table has been prepared by the Public Defenders as a guide. Individual cases should be read if they are to be relied upon.

| | NAME (age if known) | PLEA | SENTENCE | APPEAL | RECORD | HOW KILLED | INVOLVEMENT & SUMMARY |
|-----|--|-------------------------|-------------------|---------------|--|--|---|
| 51. | KAYE (33) [2013] NSWSC 1812 Price J | PG (12.5%) Murder | 21y NPP 14y 6m | | AOABH, resist police, steal mv | Stabbing / assault Intent GBH | SNPP 20 years Entered home of elderly male stranger living alone - armed self with 2 steak knives - stabbed victim in neck and assaulted him – cause of death was combined effects of blunt force injury and pre-existing medical conditions - injuries inflicted by offender a substantial cause of death - stole various items Alcohol abuse – difficult upbringing – rehabilitation prospects remain uncertain – long term need for psychiatric and alcohol counselling |
| 52. | JUBRAEEL [2014] NSWSC 838 Rothman J [2015] NSWCCA 131 Co-offender: SAFAR | VG | 17y NPP 12y | Conviction AD | AR | Shooting Joint criminal enterprise | SNPP 20 years Approached home of victim at night with two co-offenders – victim pulled back curtain to investigate and shot dead by co-offender –intended BES with no violence - first aware of gun when gun drawn by shooter shortly before shooting - lowest end of range of seriousness – shooting based on reckless indifference to life Traumatic childhood upbringing in Iraq – personal drug use – testing revealed to be in ‘intellectual disabled’ range |
| 53. | SAFAR [2014] NSWSC 376 Rothman J Co-offender: JUBRAEEL | PG (12.5%) | 15y 9m NPP 11y | | No history of violence of dishonesty | Shooting Joint criminal enterprise | SNPP 20 years Approached home of victim at night with two co-offenders – victim pulled back curtain to investigate and shot dead by co-offender –intended BES with no violence - first aware of gun when alighted car – lowest end of range of seriousness – affected by drugs and fear of co-offender prevented withdrawal Drug addiction motive for robbery – genuine remorse – good prospects of rehabilitation |

This table has been prepared by the Public Defenders as a guide. Individual cases should be read if they are to be relied upon.

| | NAME (age if known) | PLEA | SENTENCE | APPEAL | RECORD | HOW KILLED | INVOLVEMENT & SUMMARY |
|-----|--|----------------------|---------------------------------|--------|---|--|---|
| 54. | E McKELLAR (18) | VG Murder | 20y NPP 14y | | Lengthy – breached parole | Stabbing Intent GBH Extended joint criminal enterprise | SNPP 20 years Four males attended home of victim with intent to rob – victim sold small amounts of cannabis on regular occasions – group brought machete and knife to scene - victim assaulted by BMcr at door to house – BMC pursued by victim and 17y son – son stabbed by EMc twice at request of BMC to 'kill the cunt' – victim surrounded and assaulted by four offenders – stabbed four times by EMc – spontaneous assault Aboriginal brothers with difficult background including domestic violence E McKellar very low intellectual functioning B McKellar suffering brain damage from accident |
| | | Wound with intent | 8y NPP 6y | | | | |
| | B McKELLAR (28) [2014] NSWSC 1243 RA Hulme J | VG Murder | 20y NPP 14y | | Lengthy – breached bail for assault offence | | |
| | | Wound with intent | 8y NPP 6y | | | | |
| | | Att AR | 5y NPP 3y 9m | | | | |
| | | | <u>Total:</u> 24y NPP 18y | | | | |
| | | | | | | | |
| 55. | TIRAKI (21) [2014] NSWSC 1764 Schmidt J | VG | 28y NPP 20y | | | Shot Intent kill | SNPP 20 years Shot victim at close range in chest at night through window – joint criminal enterprise to commit robbery at victim's home – planned offence – gun loaded – firearm discharged deliberately not in panic – above mid-range objective seriousness Mental health issue – drug abuse Co-offender Tabbah sentence for manslaughter |

This table has been prepared by the Public Defenders as a guide. Individual cases should be read if they are to be relied upon.

| | NAME (age if known) | PLEA | SENTENCE | APPEAL | RECORD | HOW KILLED | INVOLVEMENT & SUMMARY |
|-----|--|--|--|----------------------|--|---|---|
| 56. | KENNEDY (18) [2015] NSWSC 327 Wilson J [2016] NSWCCA 114 Co-offenders: SMITH SMITH | PG (5% on appeal) | 21y NPP 15y 9m | AA 20y NPP 15y | Not as serious as co-offenders | Assault Joint criminal enterprise / intent GBH | SNPP 20 years Three men broke into home of 75y male occupant – victim severely assaulted in attempt to obtain access to safe – left for nearly a day – moral culpability high but lower than co-offenders Drug addicted – aboriginal – exposed to drugs early - low intelligence – poor schooling |
| 57. | FARROW (No.3) [2015] NSWSC 323 Rothman J | VG | 22y NPP 15y | | | Stabbing | SNPP 20 years Purchased drugs from victim – relationship soured – broke into victim’s unit, stabbed victim and stole drugs, money and jewellery – put body in car boot with intention of burying - above mid-range - planned offence – significant number of knife wounds. Significant psychoses - paranoia, schizophrenia and drug induced psychoses |
| 58. | MAAKA (18) [2015] NSWSC 358 RA Hulme J | PG (20%) Sched: 16 offences | 20y NPP 15y | | BES, AOABH, Larceny | Assault Intent GBH | SNPP 20 years Severe and violent attack upon 53y male homeowner during break in– struck victim and smashed drawer on victim’s head - unbridled, gratuitous and extreme violence – acted with 2 co-offenders - affected by drugs - not planned or premeditated Disrupted upbringing – drug abuse |
| 59. | KELSALL (20) [2015] NSWSC 480 RA Hulme J [2017] NSWCCA 240 | VG Murder Indecent assault | 40y NPP 30y FT 1y <u>Total:</u> 40y 3m NPP 30y 3m | AD | nil | Stabbing Intent to kill | SNPP 20 years Followed male stranger home late at night – entered through unlocked door – found male stranger in bedroom asleep or intoxicated – touched penis and stabbed multiple times (more than 20 wounds) – no motive although had previously reported thoughts of killing random stranger No remorse – questionable prospects of rehabilitation |
| 60. | KATSIS (17 – 44 at sentence) [2015] NSWSC 1890 Fagan J | VG Murder s.61D(1) | 20y NPP 15y FT 6y (concurrent) | AD | Subsequent record for petty offences involving dishonesty and assault | Strangulation Intent to kill | (1988) – forced entry into neighbouring unit – sexually assaulted and strangled 66y female occupant - set fire to contents of unit Abusing drugs and alcohol at time of offence – subsequent 27y demonstrates no risk of re-offending |

This table has been prepared by the Public Defenders as a guide. Individual cases should be read if they are to be relied upon.

| | NAME (age if known) | PLEA | SENTENCE | APPEAL | RECORD | HOW KILLED | INVOLVEMENT & SUMMARY |
|-----|--|--|--|--------|---|--|---|
| 61. | HAINES (31) LEE (37) [2016] NSWSC 1333 Harrison J | PG (20% - comb) Murder AR | 14y 8m NPP 11y 5y <u>Total:</u> 15y 8m NPP 12y 17y 6m NPP 13y 6m 5y <u>Total:</u> 18y 6m NPP 14y 6m | | Moderate record Significant record | Stabbing Constructive / joint criminal enterprise | SNPP 20 years Three offenders approach unit of known drug dealers with intention to rob occupants of drugs and money – during violent struggle one occupant fatally stabbed by L – second occupant assaulted by H and stabbed by L – planned robbery shortly before arriving at unit – constructive murder based on armed robbery with wounding - H did not foresee possibility knife would be used with relevant intent – below mid-range for both offences Lifelong drug addicts – difficult family backgrounds - remorse H - borderline intelligence – reasonable prospects of rehabilitation L – limited prospects of rehabilitation |
| 62. | SWAN (31) KIMURA (50) [2016] NSWSC 1819 N.Adams J | VG | 26y 6m NPP 19y 6m 23y NPP 17y | | Breached conditional liberty – assault offences Minor | Assault Intent GBH | SNPP 20 years Two males broke into unit and stole property – agreement reached in unit to assault elderly male occupant – victim assaulted by S – died of injuries 8mths later – just above mid-range – S more culpable than K – aggravating factors: in company – in victim's home – vulnerable victim – S armed with large knife S – Aboriginal with derived childhood K – Maori – assaulted in gaol because gave evidence on sentence and in protection – fearful for life – facilitated trial |

This table has been prepared by the Public Defenders as a guide. Individual cases should be read if they are to be relied upon.

| | NAME (age if known) | PLEA | SENTENCE | APPEAL | RECORD | HOW KILLED | INVOLVEMENT & SUMMARY |
|-----|---|--|--|--------|---|--------------------------|--|
| 63. | SINCLAIR (a pseudonym) (22) [2017] NSWSC 686 RA Hulme JA [2020] NSWCCA 108 | PG (15% plea and assist) Murder s.112(3) PG (35% assist and plea) s.112(3) 2 x s.86(2) s.86(2) | <u>Indicative:</u> 30y NPP 22y 6m 13y 6m NPP 10y 12y NPP 9y 8y 6m 9y <u>Aggregate</u> 38y NPP 28y 6m | AD | Minor | Assault Accessory | SNPP 20 years Broke into home of co-offender's former employer at night planning to steal from occupants – forced male occupant to show them safe – co-offender bashed male occupant to death with pick handle – also assaulted female occupant causing serious injuries – offender did not intend death but aware co-offender violent and armed with weapon One month earlier broke into family home of offender's ex-girlfriend with co-offender and third offender at night – sleeping male occupant severely assaulted around head by co-offender with pick handle causing serious and probably long-term injuries – all four occupants of house threatened and tied up with duct tape and rope All offences well above mid-range in seriousness Young offender with long term drug addiction – genuine remorse – some good prospects of rehabilitation On appeal: finding of objective gravity open to sentencing judge |
| 64. | EVANS [2017] NSWSC 1440 RA Hulme J | PG (25% plea and assist) Sched: 2 offences | 24y NPP 18y | | Assault - recklessly cause GBH – stalking / intimidate - BES | Assault Accessory | SNPP 20 years With female co-offender targeted home under mistaken belief drug dealer was living there –objective of threatening any occupants and using violence if necessary to steal – offender tied up 65y male with tape – forceful and sustained assault causing death – not known who inflicted fatal violence – assault possibly with impromptu use of items found in vicinity as weapons - victim left bound and gagged but died some short period of time after - joint criminal enterprise to detain victim with intention of stealing property in company and actual bodily harm being inflicted - premeditated invasion - mid-range Background of significant abuse - assistance |

| | NAME (age if known) | PLEA | SENTENCE | APPEAL | RECORD | HOW KILLED | INVOLVEMENT & SUMMARY |
|-----|--|---|--|--------|--|--|---|
| 65. | EVANS (No.3) (25) [2017] NSWSC 1523 RA Hulme J Co-offender: SINCLAIR | VG Murder s.112(3) s.112(3) 2 x s.86(2)(a) s.86(3) | <u>Indicative</u> 42y NPP 31y 6m 18y NPP 13y 6m 20y NPP 15y 13y 14y <u>Aggregate:</u> 48y NPP 36y | | Assault, AOABH, damage property | Assault intent to kill | SNPP 20 years Offences committed during series of home invasions with co-offenders in rural area – male murder victim attacked by offender while bound and defenceless – pick axe used to inflict severe blunt head injury – female occupant also assaulted causing serious injuries – murder well above mid-range One month earlier broke into home with co-offender and third offender at night – sleeping male occupant severely assaulted around head with pick handle causing serious and probably long-term injuries – all four occupants of house threatened and tied up with duct tape and rope Offences committed to obtain money for drug (ice) addiction - ADHD – drug use from young age. |
| 66. | PETRYK (23) [2018] NSWSC 119 Wilson J | VG Murder s.97(2) | <u>Indicative:</u> 26y 8y <u>Aggregate</u> 26y NPP 19y 6m | | Lengthy record – breached conditional liberty | Shooting Constructive murder | SNPP 20 years Broke into home with two co-offenders and shot male occupant during confrontation – threatened second, elderly occupant - intended to steal money and drugs targeting drug dealer - borrowed gun from friend prior to robbery – spontaneous shooting – robbery pre-meditated – mid-range seriousness |
| 67. | AFU (23 at offence – 51 at sentence) [2018] NSWSC 1127 RA Hulme JA | VG | 20y NPP 15y | | significant record at time of offending | Stabbing intent to kill | (1990) paid \$10,000 by co-offender to kill wife in staged break in – entered house through balcony left unlocked by co-offender and stabbed victim 23 times – high range – co-offender Caleo convicted of solicitor to murder Born in Tonga – difficult childhood in poverty – substance abuser since teenage years – at time of offending immersed in criminal world – subsequently returned to Tonga, married and has six children – good prospects of rehabilitation – isolation from family |
| 68. | FLETCHER (19) [2020] NSWSC 1478 RA Hulme J Co-Offenders: GARVEY JONES | PG (35% combined) | 15y NPP 11y 3m | | Children’s Court offences – affray | Machete / assault Accessory | SNPP 20 years Joint criminal enterprise – with two co-offenders targeted home invasion to steal drugs – co-offenders attacked victim with machete, knife and baseball bat – sustained vicious attack Reasonably good prospects of rehabilitation and of not reoffending – assistance – youth, immature, remorseful |

This table has been prepared by the Public Defenders as a guide. Individual cases should be read if they are to be relied upon.

| | NAME (age if known) | PLEA | SENTENCE | APPEAL | RECORD | HOW KILLED | INVOLVEMENT & SUMMARY |
|-----|---|--|------------------|----------------|---|----------------------------|--|
| 69. | JAGHBIR (No.4) (28) [2020] NSWSC 1704 Davies J [2023] NSWCCA 175 | VG Procure, aid and counsel murder | 11y NPP 6y 6m | Conviction AD | Subsequent offences of pervert course of justice and dishonesty | Shooting Accessory | Replaced front door of victim's unit at request of victim – kept duplicate key – intruders obtained access to unit at night and fatally shot victim in bed – assistance involved passing on duplicate key allowing assailants easy access to bedroom and some phone calls – aware offenders had accessed building two nights earlier – opportunistic offence – took advantage of position of trust – just below mid-range Married with young children – protective custody |
| 70. | CC [2020] NSWSC 946 Harrison J [2021] NSWCCA 71 | PG (20% combined with assistance) | 40y NPP 30y | AD Crown AD | Record but no details | Shot Intent to kill | SNPP 20 years Contract killing – paid \$20k by AM to shoot 15y male victim to avenge death of AM's nephew - AM provided gun – offender kicked open front door of victim's home where victim lived with his mother, her partner and other children – shot sleeping victim in head in bedroom - above right ear Aboriginal background - social and economic disadvantage - underlying paranoid schizophrenia - undertaking to give assistance On appeal: failure to specify discount for undertaking to give assistance did not invalidate sentence Crown appeal: despite breach of undertaking Crown able to use statement in judge alone trial and obtain utilitarian benefit |
| 71. | DUKAGJINI (No.2) (30 at offence – 65 at sentence) [2021] NSWSC 1668 Fagan J [2023] NSWCCA 210 | VG | 20y NPP 13y | AD | Record for housebreaking – no other violence | Strangled and assaulted | (1986) Broke into residential house and surprised by female occupant – panicked and killed victim with electrical cord and piece of wood – killing aggravated by being in home of victim Albanian – no risk of violent re-offending – long period of no offending On appeal: no error in refusal to apply s.22A facilitation of justice discount |

This table has been prepared by the Public Defenders as a guide. Individual cases should be read if they are to be relied upon.

| | NAME (age if known) | PLEA | SENTENCE | APPEAL | RECORD | HOW KILLED | INVOLVEMENT & SUMMARY |
|-----|---|----------------------------|---|--------|---|--|--|
| 72. | GARVEY (24) | PG (10%) Murder | <u>Indicative</u> 28y 9m NPP 20y 3m | | Lengthy – commenced at 11y – includes violence and robbery – breached parole and bail – shocking record of custodial breaches – existing sentence for dangerous driving causing death | Multiple incision wounds with machete during robbery | SNPP 20 years Offenders attended home of 60y male victim impersonating police officers – grabbed victim’s wallet containing \$1000 – later that day recruited co-offender – returned to victim’s house during night disguised and armed with baseball bat and machete – in confrontation with two of three male occupants victim cut multiple times with machete by G – fatal wound to upper arm – targeted home invasion for robbery – brutal assault – G primary offender – J involved in planning and aware of machete – more culpable than third offender – murder slightly above mid-range for J – more serious for G G – Aboriginal heritage – Bugmy principles applied – poor education – behavioural issues as a child – exposure to drug abuse and violence – foster care and homelessness – long history of personal substance abuse commencing at 11y – sexual abuse – never employed – possibly institutionalised – relevance of totality in light of existing sentence J – difficult childhood – drug user – mental health issue – some discount for assistance at trial |
| | | Steal from person | 13m | | | | |
| | JONES (23) | VG Murder | <u>Indicative:</u> 28y NPP 21y 6m | | Lengthy – includes domestic violence, robbery and driving offences – breached bond and parole | Extended joint criminal enterprise (J) | |
| | [2021] NSWSC 1147 RA Hulme J | PG Steal from person | 13m | | | | |
| | Co-offender: FLETCHER | Impersonate police | 9m | | | | |
| | | Driving offence | 9m | | | | |
| | | | <u>Aggregate:</u> 28y 9m NPP 22y 3m | | | | |

This table has been prepared by the Public Defenders as a guide. Individual cases should be read if they are to be relied upon.

| | NAME (age if known) | PLEA | SENTENCE | APPEAL | RECORD | HOW KILLED | INVOLVEMENT & SUMMARY |
|-----|--|-----------------------------------|---|--------|-------------------------------------|---|---|
| 73. | BURNS (No.2) (21) [2022] NSWSC 140 McCallum JA | PG (10%) Murder s.98 | <u>Indicative:</u> 19y 9m 6y 9m <u>Aggregate:</u> 21y NPP 14y | | Traffic offences only | Stabbing Intent GBH | SNPP 20 years Stabbed victim once in struggle in victim's house during attempted robbery for drugs – robbery of limited planning – stabbing intentional but fleeting and spontaneous intent based on desire to escape struggle – use of weapon aggravating factor – both offences below mid-range Prior good character – <i>Bugmy</i> factors applied – mental health issues – offence reflected immaturity and under-developed self-control – good prospects of rehabilitation – unlikely to re-offender – support of fiancé – harsh conditions in custody due to pandemic |
| 74. | COSKUN (No.5) (28) [2022] NSWSC 1216 RA Hulme JA [2024] NSWCCA 67 | VG Murder Att s.97(2) | <u>Indicative</u> 32y NPP 24y 5y <u>Aggregate:</u> 34y NPP 25y 6m | AD | Lengthy record | Shooting Constructive murder | SNPP 20 years One of two men who entered unit in early hours of morning, both armed and intent to rob drug dealer of money or drugs – offender fired ten shots – one occupant fatally shot in head and second occupant shot twice in arm – female occupant threatened with gun to head by second assailant – intent to cause GBH or at least high degree of recklessness – both offences above mid-range Born in Turkey – difficult childhood including physical and sexual abuse and early substance abuse – suffering PTSD and other mental health disorders |
| 75. | SHILLINGSWORTH (21) [2023] NSWSC 453 Wright J Co-offender: DPD EE DJD: s.111(2) MURDOCH: s.111(2) | PG (25%) | 13y 6m NPP 9y 6m | | Not stated. On conditional liberty. | Stabbed Constructive murder Accessorial liability | SNPP 20 years Male victim known to offenders – joint criminal enterprise to commit assault with intent to rob in company while armed with dangerous weapon – with four co-offenders forced themselves into victim's home, one co-offender armed with shortened rifle – victim assaulted and stabbed multiple times – unable to establish identity of killer – offender had substantial role - provided vehicle in which offenders travelled to victim's residence, pushed victim and present during assault and stabbing – some degree of planning and organisation – co-offender took money from victim's flatmate part of motivation was to obtain money - lower part of mid-range of objective seriousness Aboriginal background – <i>Bugmy</i> principles applied, traumatic upbringing – mental health conditions - substance abuse – anxiety disorder – genuine remorse – reasonable prospects of rehabilitation – youth - special circumstances - need for significant mental health and drug/alcohol treatment |

This table has been prepared by the Public Defenders as a guide. Individual cases should be read if they are to be relied upon.

| | NAME (age if known) | PLEA | SENTENCE | APPEAL | RECORD | HOW KILLED | INVOLVEMENT & SUMMARY |
|-----|---|---|----------------------|--------|---|--|--|
| 76. | DPD (17y 6m) [2023] NSWSC 477 Wright J Co-offender: SHILLINGSWORTH EE DJD: s.111(2) MURDOCH: s.111(2) | PG (17.5%) Murder Sched: Poss shorted firearm Assault | 15y 3m NPP 10y 3m | | | Stabbed Constructive murder Accessorial liability | Male victim known to offenders – joint criminal enterprise to commit assault with intent to rob in company while armed with dangerous weapon – with four co-offenders forced themselves into victim’s home - offender armed with shortened rifle – victim assaulted and stabbed multiple times – unable to establish identity of killer – offender had significant role – knew victim – carried firearm – first to reach front door - provided vehicle in which offenders travelled to victim’s residence, pushed victim and present during assault and stabbing – some degree of planning and organisation – stayed behind and attempted to obtain keys to quad bike from victim whilst still alive having been stabbed and assaulted flatmate – mid-range <i>Bugmy</i> applied, dysfunctional upbringing – significant mental health conditions causally related to offending – drug abuse - remorse – youth – some significant prospects of rehabilitation – special circumstances |
| 77. | DOUGLASS (No.2) (26 at offences – 32 at sentence) [2023] NSWSC 465 Ierace J | VG | 26y NPP 19y 6m | | Driving and firearms offences | Stabbed Intent to kill | SNPP 20 years With male partner broke into home of 69y victim to steal cash – stabbed victim twice during struggle – took cash and left victim to die – returned at least once in month before victim found to steal further cash – callous indifference to victim – aggravating factors included in company, vulnerable victim and in home of victim – not originator – mid-range Female – difficult childhood – <i>Bugmy</i> applied – PTSD – subsequent abusive relationships – moral culpability somewhat reduced – good prospects of rehabilitation – third trial |
| 78. | EE (17) [2023] NSWSC 104 Wright J Co-offenders: DPD SHILLINGSWORTH DJD: s.111(2) MURDOCH: s.111(2) | PG Murder (50% combined) Sched: Robbery | 6y 3m NPP 4y 2m | | Violence – agg break and enter – breached conditional liberty | Stabbing Constructive murder Accessorial liability | Went to home of victim with four accomplices for robbery – two accomplices armed with rifle and knife – not present in room when victim stabbed – did not intend or foresee co-offender acting with intent to kill or GBH – significantly less participation than co-offenders – robbed female resident of money - below mid-range Remorse – good prospects of rehabilitation – born in Liberia – violent father – other <i>Bugmy</i> considerations – gang involvement – drug abuse – assistance |

This table has been prepared by the Public Defenders as a guide. Individual cases should be read if they are to be relied upon.

| | NAME (age if known) | PLEA | SENTENCE | APPEAL | RECORD | HOW KILLED | INVOLVEMENT & SUMMARY |
|-----|---|---|--|--|--|--|--|
| 79. | OWENS [2018] NSWSC 1195 Schmidt J [2023] NSWCCA 198 | PG (38% combined) Murder 2 x Possess stolen firearms Sched: 3 unrelated offences | <u>Indicative</u> 18y 7m NPP 13y 11m 4y 6m NPP 3y 4m <u>Aggregate:</u> 22y 6m NPP 16y 11m | AA <u>Indicative</u> 18y 7m NPP 13y 11m 3y 8m <u>Aggregate:</u> 21y 9m NPP 16y 3m | Record – breached conditional liberty | Stabbing | SNPP 20 years With female partner broke into home of 69y male to steal money – victim fatally stabbed in struggle – body undiscovered in house for one month – offender returned several times during month to steal total \$60,000 – vulnerable victim killed in own home – in company – some planning – mid-range – other offences unrelated Ongoing mental health issues – remorse – assistance On appeal: erred in failure to apply discount to firearms offences |
| 80. | NH (57) [2023] NSWSC 428 Yehia J | PG (50% combined) | 13y NPP 8y 6m | | Nil relevant | Shooting Intent to kill Accessorial liability | SNPP 20 years Part of joint criminal enterprise to shoot dead president of rival bikie gang – drove four co-offenders to rural home of victim at night – entered house and bedroom of victim with three offenders, all armed and disguised – victim shot dead by co-offender – drove co-offenders from property, burned car and provided false alibi – joined enterprise two days prior to killing – lesser role than others - not principal and not involved in decision making – ‘minion’ – offence committed in home of victim, in company and involved planning – above mid-range Strong subjective case – sexually abused as a teenager for two years by employer – ongoing mental health issues – prior good character – remorse – good prospects of rehabilitation and unlikely to re-offend – two-year life expectancy due to cancer – onerous custodial conditions – special circumstances |
| 81. | TIRIAKI (21 at offence) [2023] NSWSC 1480 Rothman J | PG (12.5%) | 17y 6m NPP 11y 8m | | Unremarkable – driving, assault and break and enter | Shooting Accessorial liability Constructive murder | SNPP 20 years (2011) Broke into home of victim with co-offender in order to commit specially aggravated kidnapping – co-offender shot victim once to chest – offender did not encourage shooting or contemplate death – aware co-offender carrying ‘something to protect them’ – aware people in house – presence of children – co-offender sentenced for manslaughter Family support – sound prospects of rehabilitation and reduced risk of re-offending - youth |

This table has been prepared by the Public Defenders as a guide. Individual cases should be read if they are to be relied upon.

| | NAME (age if known) | PLEA | SENTENCE | APPEAL | RECORD | HOW KILLED | INVOLVEMENT & SUMMARY |
|-----|--|---|--|--------|---|--------------------------------|---|
| 82. | TRAN [2024] NSWSC 116 Lonergan J | PG (5%) Murder Enter house with intent to commit: s.111(1) AOABH: s.59 s.166 Certificate: Use carriage service to menace, harass and offend | <u>Indicative:</u> 24y NPP 18y 4y NPP 3y 2y NPP 18m <u>Aggregate:</u> 28y NPP 21y 6m (concurrent) | | Limited – subsequent conviction for possession child abuse material | Stabbing Intent to kill | SNPP 20 years Met victim through massage parlour and erroneously came to believe she was his girlfriend – engaged in obsessive behaviour when she attempted to end contact – messaged and called victim, accessed her social media accounts and attended home uninvited on multiple occasions – broke into victim’s unit and waited in bedroom with kitchen knife for her to return – stabbed victim multiple times to all parts of body – vicious and prolonged attack – failed to call for help – angry and jealous – stabbed victim’s boyfriend in arm when he attempted to intervene - well above mid-range Pleaded guilty after defence relating to mental illness fell through – facilitated administration of justice – chronic schizophrenia not relevant to offending but taken into account in relation to deterrence and custodial conditions – remorse |
| 83. | DASTAN [2024] NSWSC 55 Harrison CJ at CL | VG Murder s.93T(1) Participate in crim group | 21y NPP 15y 6m 18m (concurrent) | | | Shooting Intent to kill | SNPP 20 years Vigilante act of revenge for assault on brother – mistakenly believed victim responsible – attended home of victim and shot him four times – planned confrontation – recruited co-offenders – upset by assault on brother but failed to clarify circumstances of assault and response disproportionate – slightly above mid-range Extremely unfortunate childhood – violence, parental incarceration and exposure to substance abuse – took responsibility for younger brother – mental health issues and substance abuse – little or no prospect of re-offending in similar way – special circumstances |

Last Updated: Mar 2024

This table has been prepared by the Public Defenders as a guide. Individual cases should be read if they are to be relied upon.